Harris R. Anthony General Counsel - Florida



BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. Museum Tower Building Suite 1910 150 West Flagler Street Mlami, Florida 33130 Phone (305) 530-5555

June 18, 1993

Mr. Steve C. Tribble
Director, Division of Records and Reporting
Florida Public Service Commission
101 East Gaines Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Re: Docket No. 920260-TL

Dear Mr. Tribble:

Enclosed please find an original and fifteen copies of the Joint Motion of the Attorney General and Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company for Commissioner Thomas M. Beard to be Recused, which we ask that you file in the captioned docket.

A copy of this letter is enclosed. Please mark it to indicate that the original was filed and return the copy to me. Copies have been served to the parties shown on the attached Certificate of Service.

Sincerely yours,

Harris R. Anthony

Enclosures

cc: All Parties of Record

A. M. Lombardo

1 W/M R. Douglas Lackey

150

RCH \_\_\_\_

SEC /

CHU AL

(print \_\_\_\_

RECEIVED & FILED

EPSC-BUREAU OF RECORDS

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

06572 JUN 188

TTSS-RECORDS/REFURING



## BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Comprehensive Review of the Revenue Requirements and Rate Stabilization Plan of SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY.

Docket No. 920260-TL Filed: June 18, 1993

## JOINT MOTION OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL AND SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY FOR COMMISSIONER THOMAS M. BEARD TO BE RECUSED

COME NOW, Attorney General Robert A. Butterworth ("Attorney General") and BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. d/b/a Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company ("Southern Bell" or "Company") and hereby jointly move that Commissioner Thomas M. Beard be recused from participating in the consideration of any Southern Bell matters that may be pending now or in the future before the Florida Public Service Commission (the "Commission"). As grounds for this Motion, the Attorney General and Southern Bell state:

1. It has recently become known to the public that Commissioner Beard has had personal relationships with two employees of Southern Bell while he has been sitting as a Florida Public Service Commissioner. Both Commissioner Beard and the two Southern Bell employees have stated that, during the course of these relationships, they have not engaged in any discussion of any Florida regulatory matters pertaining to Southern Bell. They have also stated that no Southern Bell funds were expended on behalf of Commissioner Beard. Commissioner Beard Dear Applications DATE

06572 JUN 188

indicated that the votes he has cast in issues that would affect Southern Bell have not, in any fashion, been affected by his relationships with these two individuals.

- 2. Nonetheless, the existence of these relationships has resulted in a significant amount of public controversy over the propriety of Commissioner Beard's participating in decisions involving Southern Bell matters. This controversy has called into question the impartiality of decisions rendered by the Commission. For our form of government to operate effectively, the confidence of the public in its governmental institutions must remain at the highest levels possible. Thus, even the appearance of impropriety by governmental officials must be avoided.
- 3. In this instance, the perception of the public as to the nature of the relationships between Commissioner Beard and the Southern Bell employees must be recognized and taken into account. That perception, even if based upon a misunderstanding of the facts as set forth by the persons involved, has raised concerns regarding the independence and impartiality of Commissioner Beard relating to Southern Bell matters.
- 4. Southern Bell maintains that neither the company, its management nor any of its employees has sought to improperly influence, or has improperly influenced, Commissioner Beard. An inquiry by the Office of the Attorney General into Commissioner Beard's relationships with the two Southern Bell employees, and certain related matters, has found no direct evidence to refute the company's assertions. Both the Attorney General and Southern

Bell recognize, however, that whether or not there has been any effort to influence Commissioner Beard's decisions or whether or not Commissioner Beard's votes have actually been influenced by these relationships is not the test by which the public will judge Commissioner Beard's record. Rather, the question that must be addressed is whether or not there has been the appearance of impropriety. It would appear that, based upon the publicity that this matter has generated, the public does question the propriety of Commissioner Beard's conduct. Accordingly, despite the fact that there has been no determination made that Commissioner Beard has been in any way improperly influenced in his capacity as a Commissioner, the Attorney General and Southern Bell believe that it is in the best interest of the public, the Commission, and Commissioner Beard himself, that Commissioner Beard be recused from participating in any Southern Bell matter currently pending before the Commission or that may in the future come before the Commission.

5. Both the Attorney General and Southern Bell recognize that Commissioner Beard's recusal from all Southern Bell matters may create certain administrative difficulties for the Commission. These potential difficulties will be outweighed, though, by the benefits to the public of such action. Public confidence in the fairness and impartiality of its government can only be strengthened and enhanced by Commissioner Beard's recusal. Moreover, any administrative issues that may arise when the Commission is deciding Southern Bell matters will be for a limited duration. Commissioner Beard has already informed

Governor Chiles that he will not seek reappointment upon the expiration of his current term in December of 1993.

6. This Joint Motion shall not be construed as an indication that any of Commissioner Beard's prior votes in Southern Bell matters were improperly influenced by any party to any of those proceedings. Further, this Joint Motion shall not be construed as indicating that Southern Bell has engaged in any wrongdoing or impropriety in this matter.

WHEREFORE, the Attorney General and Southern Bell respectfully move that Commissioner Beard be recused from participating in any Southern Bell matter, including but not limited to any votes that the Commission may take in such matters.

Respectfully submitted,

ATTORNEY FOR SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY

HARRIS R. ANTHONY

150 West Flagler Street, #1910

Miami, FL 33130

(305)530-5557

ROBERT A BUTTERWORTH

PETER ANTONACCI

PL-01, The Capitol

Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

(904)487-1963

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE Docket No. 920260-TL

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the foregoing has been furnished by United States Mail this /8 day of func, 1993 to:

Robin Norton
Division of Communications
Florida Public Service
Commission
101 East Gaines Street
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0866

Tracy Hatch Division of Legal Services Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863

Joseph A. McGlothlin Vicki Gordon Kaufman McWhirter, Grandoff & Reeves 315 South Calhoun Street Suite 716 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1838 atty for FIXCA

Joseph Gillan J. P. Gillan and Associates Post Office Box 541038 Orlando, Florida 32854-1038

Patrick K. Wiggins
Wiggins & Villacorta, P.A.
Post Office Drawer 1657
Tallahassee, Florida 32302
atty for Intermedia and Cox

Laura L. Wilson, Esq.
Messer, Vickers, Caparello,
Madsen, Lewis & Metz, PA
Post Office Box 1876
Tallahassee, FL 32302
atty for FPTA

Charles J. Beck
Deputy Public Counsel
Office of the Public Counsel
111 W. Madison Street
Room 812
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1400

Michael J. Henry MCI Telecommunications Corp. MCI Center Three Ravinia Drive Atlanta, Georgia 30346-2102

Richard D. Melson Hopping Boyd Green & Sams Post Office Box 6526 Tallahassee, Florida 32314 atty for MCI

Rick Wright
Regulatory Analyst
Division of Audit and Finance
Florida Public Svc. Commission
101 East Gaines Street
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0865

Peter M. Dunbar
Haben, Culpepper, Dunbar & French, P.A.
306 North Monroe Street
Post Office Box 10095
Tallahassee, FL 32301
atty for FCTA

Chanthina R. Bryant
Sprint Communications Co.
Limited Partnership
3065 Cumberland Circle
Atlanta, GA 30339

Michael W. Tye
AT&T Communications of the
Southern States, Inc.
106 East College Avenue
Suite 1410
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Dan B. Hendrickson Post Office Box 1201 Tallahassee, FL 32302 atty for FCAN

Benjamin H. Dickens, Jr. Blooston, Mordkofsky, Jackson & Dickens 2120 L Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20037 Atty for Fla Ad Hoc

C. Everett Boyd, Jr.
Ervin, Varn, Jacobs, Odom
& Ervin
305 South Gadsen Street
Post Office Drawer 1170
Tallahassee, Florida 32302
atty for Sprint

Florida Pay Telephone Association, Inc. c/o Mr. Lance C. Norris President Suite 202 8130 Baymeadows Circle, West Jacksonville, FL 32256

Monte Belote Florida Consumer Action Network 4100 W. Kennedy Blvd., #128 Tampa, FL 33609

Bill L. Bryant, Jr., Esq. Foley & Lardner Suite 450 215 South Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32302-0508 Atty for AARP Michael B. Twomey Gerald B. Curington Department of Legal Affairs Room 1603, The Capitol Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Mr. Douglas S. Metcalf Communications Consultants, Inc. 631 S. Orlando Ave., Suite 250 P. O. Box 1148 Winter Park, FL 32790-1148

Mr. Cecil O. Simpson, Jr. General Attorney
Mr. Peter Q. Nyce, Jr. General Attorney
Regulatory Law Office
Office of the Judge
Advocate General
Department of the Army
901 North Stuart Street
Arlington, VA 22203-1837

Mr. Michael Fannon Cellular One 2735 Capital Circle, NE Tallahassee, FL 32308

Floyd R. Self, Esq.
Messer, Vickers, Caparello,
Madsen, Lewis, Goldman & Metz
Post Office Box 1876
Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876
Attys for McCaw Cellular

Angela Green Division of Legal Services Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863

Stan Greer
Division of Communications
Florida Public Svc. Commission
101 East Gaines Street
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863

phues MacCy