Marguerite McLean

IJ1000PD

From:

McNeill, Shayla L Capt USAF AFLOA JACL-ULT/AFCESA/CENL

[shayla.mcneill@TYNDALL.AF.MIL] Thursday, November 12, 2009 2:06 PM

Sent: To:

Filings@psc.state.fl.us

Cc:

Jungels, Allan L Capt USAF AFLOA JACL-ULT/AFCESA/CENL

Subject:

090001-EI FEA Post Hearing Brief

Signed By:

There are problems with the signature. Click the signature button for details.

Attachments:

FEA Post Hearing Brief-Docket 090001-El.pdf



1. Captain Shayla L. McNeill, 139 Barnes Ave, Suite 1 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 is the person responsible for this electronic filing;

1

2. The filing is to be made in Docket 090001-El, In re: Fuel and Purchased Power Cost Recovery Clause;

- 3. The filing is made on behalf of the Federal Executive Agencies (FEA);
- 4. The total number of pages is 6; and
- 5. The attached document is The FEA Post Hearing Brief.

SHAYLA L. MCNEILL, Capt, USAF Utility Law Field Support Center (ULFSC) Staff Attorney AFLOA/JACL-ULFSC 139 Barnes Drive Tyndall AFB, FL 32403-5317 850-283-6663 DSN 523-6663 Cell 850-276-5705

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Fuel and Purchased Power)	Docket No.: 090001-EI
Cost Recovery Clause)	Filed: Nov 12, 2009

THE FEDERAL EXECUTIVE AGENCIES' POST HEARING BRIEF

The Federal Executive Agencies (FEA) has no position with regard to the remaining issues concerning Florida Public Utilities Company.

Regarding issues 8, 9, 10, 12, 13 and 15 for Gulf Power Company (Gulf), there are three concerns that were raised by the Florida Industrial Power Users Group (FIPUG) that FEA will comment on briefly.

- 1. With regard to Plant Scherer, Gulf is seeking to recover the fuel costs associated with the plant although the plant is not included in base rates. The position of the FEA is that the earlier decision not to include Plant Scherer in base rates indicates the commission previously determined the plant did not benefit rate payers in Florida. Costs that do not benefit rate payers should not be recovered, to include fuel costs.
- 2. The documents provided seem to indicate that Gulf is paying affiliates for capacity required to meet the minimum reserve requirement, while at the same time selling electricity to affiliates at a cost below the cost of production which in part necessitate the capacity payments.
- 3. The documents provided seem to also indicate that, on average, Gulf is selling electricity to affiliates at a lower price than it would cost to produce the electricity itself and buying electricity at a higher price than it would have been able to produce the electricity itself. This is the case though it appears Gulf ratepayers used approximately 40 percent less power than Gulf's estimates show it is capable of producing.

11261 NOV 128

The second and third concerns both relate to the question of whether Gulf acted prudently with regard to spot market purchases from and sales to affiliates. Gulf failed to put any evidence in the record to demonstrate the prudence of the sales and purchases made resulting in a failure to justify the transactions that do not appear to be at arms length.

In Fla. Power Corp. v. Cresse, 413 So. 2d 1187 (FL 1982), the Florida Supreme Court said, "The requirement that utilities demonstrate the reasonableness of their fuel costs is not improper or unusual. 'Burden of proof in a commission proceeding is always on a utility seeking a rate change, and upon other parties seeking to change established rates.'" The evidence Gulf put forth in testimony, both prefiled and live, failed to demonstrate that the recovery requested is reasonable. The explanation by Mr. Ball in his live testimony that the inference drawn by FIPUG is not correct and instead is the result of using a marginal cost approach to determine when to produce electricity and when to purchase it may be a start toward answering the concerns, but it is not enough.

Presumably, it would have been possible to demonstrate how using the method Mr. Ball described could cause the average cost of electricity bought from and sold to affiliates to move so far from the average cost of production, and at least conceptually in the wrong directions from a ratepayer perspective. However, Gulf did not present any evidence to demonstrate how this actually occurred. Gulf did not carry its burden on this issue. Therefore, Gulf should not be allowed to recover these costs through the fuel adjustor.

Allan L. Jungels, Capt, USAF

AFLOA/JACL-ULFSC

139 Barnes Drive, Suite 1 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403-5319

Telephone: (850) 283-6350

FAX: (850) 283-6219

allan.jungels@tyndall.af.mil

Attorney for the FEA

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing FEA Post Hearing Brief has been furnished by electronic mail (e-mail) this <u>12</u>th day of November, 2009, to the below-mentioned parties:

Ausley Law Firm Lee L. Willis/James D. Beasley Post Office Box 391 Tallahassee, FL 32302 Phone: 850-224-9115 FAX: 222-7560

Beggs & Lane Law Firm J. Stone/R. Badders/S.Griffin P.O. Box 12950 Pensacola, FL 32591 Phone: 850-432-2451 FAX: 850-469-3331

Lisa C. Bennett, Esq.
Office of General Counsel
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

Florida Industrial Power Users Group John W. McWhirter, Jr. c/o McWhirter Law Firm P.O. Box 3350 Tampa, FL 33601-3350 Phone: 813-505-8055 FAX: 813-221-1854 Email: jmcwhirter@mac-law.com

Florida Power & Light Company Mr. Wade Litchfield 215 South Monroe Street, Suite 810 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1859

Phone: (850) 521-3900

FAX: 521-3939

Email: wade litchfield@fpl.com

Florida Power & Light Company

John T. Butler

700 Universe Boulevard

Juno Beach, FL 33408

Phone: 561-304-5639 FAX: 561-691-7135

Email: john butler@fpl.com

Florida Public Utilities Company

Curtis D. Young P.O. Box 3395

West Palm Beach, FL 33402-3395

Phone: 561-838-1762 Fax: 561-833-8562

Florida Retail Federation

John Rogers

100 East Jefferson Street

Tallahassee, FL 32301

Phone: 850-222-4082

Gulf Power Company

Ms. Susan D. Ritenour

One Energy Place

Pensacola, FL 32520-0780

Phone: (850) 444-6231

FAX: (850) 444-6026

Email: sdriteno@southernco.com

Keefe Law Firm

Vicki Gordon Kaufman/Jon C. Moyle, Jr.

118 North Gadsden Street

Tallahassee, FL 32301

Phone: 850-681-3828

Fax: 681-8878

Email: vkaufman@kagmlaw.com

Messer Law Firm

Norman H. Horton, Jr.

Post Office Box 15579

Tallahassee, FL 32317

Phone: 850-222-0720

FAX: 224-4359

Email: nhorton@lawfla.com

Office of Attorney General Cecilia Bradley The Capitol - PL01 Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Phone: 850-414-3300 FAX: 414-9650

Office of Public Counsel J.R. Kelly/C. Rehwinkel/P. Christensen c/o The Florida Legislature 111 W. Madison Street, Room 812 Tallahassee, FL 32399-1400

Phone: 850-488-9330

PCS Phosphate – White Springs (Brickfield) James Brew/F. Alvin Taylor/Randy B. 1025 Thomas Jefferson St. NW West Tower, Eighth Floor Washington, DC 20007 Phone: 202-342-0800 FAX: 202-342-0807

Email: jbrew@bbrslaw.com

Progress Energy Florida, Inc. Mr. Paul Lewis, Jr. 106 East College Avenue, Suite 800 Tallahassee, FL 32301-7740 Phone: (850) 222-8738

FAX: 222-9768

Email: paul.lewisjr@pgnmail.com

Progress Energy Service Company, LLC John T. Burnett P.O. Box 14042 Saint Petersburg, FL 33733-4042

Phone: 727-820-5184 FAX: 727-820-5519

Email: john.burnett@pgnmail.com

Tampa Electric Company Ms. Paula K. Brown Regulatory Affairs P. O. Box 111 Tampa, FL 33601-0111

Phone: (813) 228-1444 FAX: (813) 228-1770

Email: Regdept@tecoenergy.com

Young Law Firm R. Scheffel Wright/John Thomas LaVia III c/o Florida Retail Federation 225 South Adams Street, Suite 200 Tallahassee, FL 32301

Phone: 850-222-7206 FAX: 561-6834

Email: swright@yvlaw.net

Allan L. Jungels, Capt, USAF AFLOA/ULFSC Attorney