Nature10/2/20083:35:33 PM1age 1 of 1

Ruth Nettles

| From: | terry.scobie@verizon.com |
|---|--|
| Sent: | Thursday, October 02, 2008 2:37 PM |
| То: | Filings@psc.state.fl.us |
| Cc: | de.oroark@verizon.com; Kimberly Caswell; David Christian; demetria.g.clark@verizon.com |
| Subject: | Undocketed 08-0000 - CLEC Intrastate Access Charges |
| Attachments: CLEC Intrastate Access Charges-WV PSC Staff Rec filing.pdf | |



The attached filing is submitted on behalf of Verizon by

Dulaney L. O'Roark P. O. Box 110, MC FLTC0007 Tampa, Florida 33601 (678) 259-1449 de.oroark@verizon.com

The attached .pdf document consists of a total of 5 pages (cover letter-1 page, Staff Recommendation-4 pages).

Terry Scobie Legal Secretary II Verizon Legal Department P. O. Box 110 - MC FLTC0007 Tampa, Florida 33601-0110 813-483-2610 (tel) 813-204-8870 (fax) terry.scobie@verizon.com

> DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE 09338 OCT-28 FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

Dulaney L. O'Roark III Vice President & General Counsel, Southeast Region Legal Department



5055 North Point Parkway Alpharetta, Georgia 30022

Phone 678-259-1449 Fax 678-259-1589 de.oroark@verizon.com

October 2, 2008 – VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Ann Cole, Commission Clerk Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

Re: Undocketed 08-0000 CLEC Intrastate Access Charges

Dear Ms. Cole:

Enclosed for filing in the above matter is a West Virginia Public Service Commission Staff memorandum, released on October 1, 2008, recommending a cap on competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") intrastate switched access rates at the level of the competing incumbent local exchange carrier rates. The West Virginia recommendation is consistent with the actions of more than a dozen other states that have imposed constraints on CLEC access rates. A CLEC access rate cap is also under consideration in Massachusetts, where the Department of Telecommunications and Cable concluded hearings on a proposed cap last week.

Verizon urges the Florida Public Service Commission to move forward with a docketed proceeding to consider capping CLEC access rates.

Sincerely,

Dulaney L. O'Roark III

tas

Enclosure

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE 09338 OCT-2 8 FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

Public Service Commission Of West Virginia

201 Brooks Street, P. O. Box 812 Charleston, West Virginia 25323



Phone: (304) 340-0300 FAX: (304) 340-0325

October 1, 2008

Joseph J. Starsick, Jr., Esq. Counsel, Verizon West Virginia Inc., et al. Goodwin & Goodwin PO Box 2107 Charleston, WV 25328-2107

Patrick Pearlman, Esq. Consumer Advocate Division 700 Union Building 723 Kanawha Boulevard, East Charleston, WV 25301 Robert R. Rodecker, Esq. Counsel, AT&T Communications of West Virginia, Inc. PO Box 3713 Charleston, WV 25337

James V. Kelsh, Esq. Counsel, Level 3 Communications, LLC Rodecker Law Office PO Box 3713 Charleston, WV 25337-3713

David L. Haga, Esq. Assistant General Counsel Verizon 1515 North Courthouse Road Arlington, VA 22201

> Case No. 08-0656-T-GI Verizon West Virginia Inc., Bell Atlantic Communications, Inc., dba Verizon Long Distance, MCIMetro Access Transmission Services, LLC, dba Verizon Access Transmission Services and MCI Communications

Gentlemen:

RE:

Pursuant to Rule 2 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, enclosed is a copy of the Staff memorandum in this matter. If you wish to respond to the enclosed Staff memorandum, you may do so in writing, within 10 days, unless directed otherwise, of this date.

Your failure to respond in writing to the utility's answer, Staff's recommendations, or other documents may result in a decision in your case based on your original filing and the other documents in the case file, without further hearing or notice.

You have the ability to view documents as they are filed in this case if you have email. Please visit our web site at <u>www.psc.state.wv.us</u> and register with our email subscription system to receive customized daily activity information in this case. The public will not be given access to your email address. If you have provided an email address you will automatically receive docket notifications as documents are filed.

Most documents filed after December 1, 2005, regarding PSC Formal Cases, are now viewable in PDF format on our web site at <u>www.psc.state.wv.us.</u>

Sincerely, Sandra Squire Director

Executive Secretary Division

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

09338 OCT-2 s

SS/cg Enclosure

FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

FINAL JOINT STAFF MEMORANDUM

SANDRA SQUIRE Executive Secretary DATE: October 1, 2008

FROM:

RE:

TO:

LISA L. WANSLEY Staff Attorney

CASE NO. 08-0656-T-PC VERIZON WEST VIRGINIA INC., BELL ATLANTIC COMMUNICATIONS, INC., DBA VERIZON LONG DISTANCE, MCIMETRO ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES LLC, DBA VERIZON ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES, AND MCI COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC., DBA VERIZON BUSINESS SERVICES

On April 25, 2008, Verizon filed a petition requesting the institution of a general investigation of the intrastate switched access charges of competitive local exchange carriers.

By a June 26, 2008 Commission Order, a general investigation was initiated, all CLEC's and ILEC's were named respondents and the Administrative Law Judge due date was extended to February 2, 2009. Further, the Staff report was scheduled for October 1, 2008 and response to Staff's report were due by November 2, 2008.

Attached for filing find Staff's final memorandum drafted by David Howell, Utilities Division.

LWL/kf Attachment

CWS ()

H:\LWANSLEY\WPDOCS\08-0656-T-PC\FJSM.wpd



PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF WEST VIRGINIA UTILITIES DIVISION FINAL RECOMMENDATION

FROM: David Howell, Utilities Analyst Utilities Division

DATE: October 1, 2008

SUBJECT: CASE NO. 08-0656-T-GI VERIZON WEST VIRGINIA INC., BELL ATLANTIC COMMUNICATIONS, INC., dba VERIZON LONG DISTANCE, MCIMETRO ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES LLC, dba VERIZON ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES, AND MCI COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES INC., dba VERIZON BUSINESS SERVICES

> Petition by Verizon West Virginia Inc., Bell Atlantic Communications, Inc., dba Verizon Long Distance, MCImetro Access Transmission Services LLC, dba Verizon Access Transmission Services, and MCI Communications Services Inc., dba Verizon Business Services (filed 4/25/08)

On April 25, 2008, Verizon West Virginia Inc., Bell Atlantic Communications, Inc., dba Verizon Long Distance, MCImetro Access Transmission Services LLC, dba Verizon Access Transmission Services, and MCI Communications Services Inc., dba Verizon Business Services filed this Petition requesting that the Public Service Commission of West Virginia, (hereinafter, the "Commission") institute a General Investigation of the Intrastate Switched Access Charges of Competitive Local Exchange Carriers Operating in West Virginia. Verizon West Virginia's reasons for filing its request for a General Investigation are outlined in its Petition.

On May 28, 2008, the Commission referred this Case to the Division of Administrative Law Judges.

On June 26, 2008, the Commission initiated a general investigation; joined all competitive local exchange carriers (CLECs) and incumbent local exchange carriers

Case No. 08-0656-T-GI October 1, 2008 Page 2

(ILECs) operating in West Virginia; and extended the Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") decision due date to February 2, 2009.

In its initial Petition, Verizon-WV stated that CLECs currently charge intrastate switch access rates substantially higher than those of incumbent local exchange carrier ("ILEC") Verizon-WV. While most CLECs in West Virginia have maintained the higher access rates, Verizon-WV has steadily lowered its intrastate access rates since 2002. Verizon-WV proposed that the Commission find that CLEC intrastate access rates may not exceed the access rates charged by the competing ILEC in the same service area.

Currently, the FCC has capped CLEC interstate switched access rates at the per minute rate of the ILEC with which the CLEC competes. CLEC access charges that do not exceed the benchmark are presumed to be just and reasonable. All CLECs in West Virginia already must comply with the FCC rule and must charge interstate access rates that do not exceed the interstate access rates of competing ILECs.

Several states have adopted regulations mirroring the FCC's price cap approach for CLEC access rates. Maryland established a rule capping CLECs switched access rates at the level of the ILEC's switched access rates prior to the FCC rule. Pennsylvania limited CLEC access rates to those of the ILEC unless the higher access rates can be demonstrated to be cost justified. New York and Louisiana Public Service Commissions require that CLEC intrastate switch access charges not exceed those of the ILEC. Connecticut, Virginia, Ohio, Missouri and New Hampshire have all acted to limit CLEC access rates to the access rate of the ILEC. Other State Commissions such as Indiana, Iowa, Maine, Michigan, and Washington have imposed constraints on CLECs' intrastate access rates by requiring them to mirror the carriers' interstate rates.

Staff recommends that CLECs in West Virginia adjust their switch access rates to mirror those of the ILEC it competes with or file a cost justification with the Commission for the higher rate it wishes to charge.

DH/dh