

**ORIGINAL**

**ATTACHMENT B**

**BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.**  
**FPSC Docket No. 040443-TL**  
**Request for Specified Confidential**  
**Classification**  
**Page 1 of 1**  
**05/28/04**

**REQUEST FOR SPECIFIED CONFIDENTIAL CLASSIFICATION OF CLEC**  
**INFORMATION CONTAINED IN BELL SOUTH'S PETITION FOR THE**  
**OPENING OF A DOCKET TO ESTABLISH A NEW PERFORMANCE**  
**ASSESSMENT PLAN FILED MAY 12, 2004 IN DOCKET 040443-TL.**

**TWO REDACTED COPIES**

**CMP** \_\_\_\_\_  
**COM** \_\_\_\_\_  
**CTR** \_\_\_\_\_  
**ECR** \_\_\_\_\_  
**GCL** \_\_\_\_\_  
**OPC** \_\_\_\_\_  
**MMS** \_\_\_\_\_  
**RCA** \_\_\_\_\_  
**SCR** \_\_\_\_\_  
**SEC**   I    
**OTH** \_\_\_\_\_

**DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE**

**06117 MAY 28 3**

**FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK**

	CLEC	Product	Month '03	SEEM \$	Trouble Reports / In Service Circuits
A					
B	CLEC-1	Local Interconnection Trunks	September	\$1,200	1 / 5733
C	CLEC-2	UNE Combo Other	September	\$4,750	1 / 12
D	CLEC-3	Digital Loop $\geq$ DS1	August	\$14,250	1 / 34
E	CLEC-4	UNE ISDN Loop	September	\$6,650	1 / 51
F	CLEC-5	UNE ISDN Loop	August	\$4,750	1 / 48
G	CLEC-6	UNE Loop & Port Combo	August	\$4,750	1 / 19

In every instance above, the CLEC simply claimed on one occasion that the CLEC had experienced a trouble. Significantly, there may not have been a condition where the customer's service was impaired. Yet, because the circuits in service were relatively small – such as the 12 circuits on the second item in the table, the trouble report rate, 1 divided by 12, was 8% and was above the retail comparison primarily due to the comparatively large number of retail lines in service. For each item above, the single trouble report generated a SEEM payment ranging from \$1,200 to \$14,250. Since the monthly rate for these services averages approximately \$100, the SEEM payment for a single trouble report is equivalent to literally years of service – for free.

(ii) PERCENT PROVISIONING TROUBLES WITHIN 30 DAYS (PPT)

PPT measures the number of service orders where troubles were reported within 30 days of service order completion. In the existing Florida SEEM plan, this SQM measure is disaggregated by product, as noted under Customer Trouble Report Rate above, and also by greater than 10 circuits, less than 10 circuits, dispatch and non-dispatch (a dispatch means a

technician had to be dispatched to the customer's premise). The result is 109 Tier-1 SEEM measures for each CLEC. BellSouth paid over \$1,100,000 in Tier-1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale SEEM measures for PPT. Of the total of \$1,100,000, \$976,000 was paid for UNE service order installations that had trouble rates of 4% or less. In other words, BellSouth paid \$976,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments while installing over 96% of the service orders perfectly, without a trouble report (as with the Customer Trouble Report Rate [above], a trouble report does not necessarily mean the customer's service was impaired). The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments for just one trouble reported in a given month for all circuits that were installed in the previous 30 days:

	1	2	3	4	5
	CLEC	Product/dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	Trouble Reports / Installed Circuits
A	CLEC-7	2WAnalog Loop Design with LNP Non Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 6
B	CLEC-8	UNE Loop & Port Dispatch-In	October	\$4,750	1 / 22
C	CLEC-6	UNE Loop & Port Dispatch-In	September	\$4,750	1 / 16
D	CLEC-9	UNE Loop & Port Dispatch-In	September	\$4,750	1 / 17
E	CLEC-7	2WAnalog Loop Design Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 5
F	CLEC-10	EELs Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 12
G	CLEC-10	UNE Loop & Port Switched Based Orders	September	\$10,450	1 / 24
H					

As with the Customer Trouble Report rate, the SEEM payment is equivalent to many years of BellSouth revenue for the service.

(iii) PERCENT REPEAT TROUBLE REPORTS WITHIN 30 DAYS (PRT)

As the name implies, this measure captures the frequency of repeat troubles reports by dividing the number of trouble reports on lines that had one or more trouble reports within the preceding 30 days by the total number of trouble reports. This measure has the dubious distinction of actually penalizing BellSouth for maintaining a high quality network. If the quality of the network is such that there are few troubles reported (as noted above where the trouble-free rate was 98% ) any repeat trouble is likely to produce a high repeat trouble rate, which as a result, triggers SEEM penalties. For instance BellSouth paid over \$514,000 in Tier-1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale SEEM measures for PRT. Of the \$514,000, BellSouth paid over \$469,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments, even though the overall CLEC rate was actually lower (better) than the retail comparison. The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments for overall repeat rates in a given month that were less than the retail comparison:

	<u>1</u>	<u>2</u>	<u>3</u>	<u>4</u>	<u>5</u>
A	CLEC	Product/dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	CLEC Rate / Retail Rate
B	CLEC-3	UNE Loop & Port Dispatch	August	\$4750	17.23 / 18.81
			September	\$6650	12.00 / 18.32
C	CLEC-11	UNE Loop & Port Dispatch	September	\$4750	10.60 / 18.32

Paying for superior service (as above) can occur when the number of CLEC troubles is small and is concentrated in a relatively few wire centers. Once again, the penalty amounts to several years of free service to the CLEC.

(iv) ORDER COMPLETION INTERVAL (OCI)

This measure reflects the time period from receipt of a valid order from the CLEC to the delivery of the service to the end-user. In the existing Florida SEEM plan this SQM measure is disaggregated by product, and also by greater than 10 circuits, less than 10 circuits, dispatch and non-dispatch. The result is 125 Tier-1 SEEM measures for each CLEC. An example of a UNE SEEM measure is "Average Completion Interval (OCI) & Order Completion Interval Distribution, Non-Dispatch Dispatch in < 10 - UNE Loop and Port Combo." BellSouth paid over \$666,000 in Tier1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale OCI SEEM measures. Of the \$666,000, BellSouth paid over \$198,000 in Tier1 SEEM payments just for the UNE Loop & Port Combinations Non Dispatch sub-metric where the aggregate OCI interval for the CLECs was 1.37 days, bettering the retail analog of 2.18 days during the three-month period. The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments even though their orders were completed in a shorter interval than the retail comparison. All of these measurements have less than 10 circuits per order.

A	3				
	4				5
	CLEC	Product/dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	CLEC interval / Retail interval (days)
B	CLEC-7	2W Analog Loop Design Non Dispatch	August	\$6,650	4.00 / 4.68
C	CLEC-12	UNE Loop & Port Combo Non Dispatch	October	\$4,750	2.50 / 2.57

	1	2	3	4	5
A	CLEC-1	UNE Loop & Port Combo Non Dispatch	October	\$4,750	2.33 / 2.57
B	CLEC-10	2W Analog Loop w/LNP Design Dispatch	September	\$6,650	4.33 / 4.47

Once again, the SEEM payment is exorbitant (several years of service) when compared to the level of service received. Again in each of these instances the CLEC orders were installed on average more quickly than the comparable retail orders.

(v) PERCENT OUT OF SERVICE > 24 HOURS (OOS)

This measure captures troubles, which result in an out-of-service condition (can't call or be called) that are not resolved within 24 hours. BellSouth paid over \$512,000 in Tier-1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale SEEM measures for OOS. Of the \$512,000, BellSouth paid over \$431,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments even though the total aggregate percentage of troubles out of service greater than 24 hours for the CLECs was 8% less (better) than the retail analog comparison. The following are some examples of payments to CLECs for just one trouble out of service greater than 24 hours in

		2	3	4	5
A	CLEC	Product / dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	Reports OOS > 24 / Total OOS Reports
B	CLEC-13	UNE Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 15
C	CLEC-1	UNE Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 11
D	CLEC-14	UNE ISDN Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 9
E	CLEC-15	UNE ISDN Non Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 20

A B C	CLEC-10	UNE ISDN Non Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 22
	CLEC-3	UNE Loop & Port Combo Non Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 8
	CLEC-16	UNE Loop & Port Combo Non Dispatch	August October	\$6,650 \$4,750	1 / 35 1 / 13

This measurement is another metric that can penalize BellSouth for good service. Since this measurement divides the total number of out of service troubles greater than 24 hours by the total number of out of service troubles, the fewer the total out of service troubles, the greater the potential for generating a penalty with just one trouble. The two examples with 9 and 8 troubles respectively illustrate this problem. As with many of the other examples, the SEEM payment of \$4,750 or above for one trouble is significantly disproportionate to the level of service received when compared to the monthly rate for the service.

(vi) PERCENT MISSED INSTALLATION APPOINTMENTS (PMIA)

This measure shows BellSouth's ability to install service on the scheduled day. In the existing Florida SEEM plan this metric is disaggregated by product, and also by greater than 10 circuits, less than 10 circuits, dispatch and non-dispatch. The result is 125 Tier 1 SEEM measures for each CLEC. BellSouth paid over \$559,000 in Tier 1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale SEEM measures for PMIA. Of the \$559,000, BellSouth paid over \$500,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments, even though less than 1% of the installation appointments were missed. In other words, BellSouth met over 99% of all scheduled installation commitments during this three month period – but the SEEM plan required

payments of \$500,000. The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments for just one missed installation appointment:

	1	2	3	4	5
A	CLEC	Product/dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	Missed Appt. / Total Appts.
B	CLEC-6	2WAnalog Loop Design Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 8
			October	\$6,650	1 / 9
C	CLEC-12	2WAnalog Loop Design with LNP Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 8
D	CLEC-10	2WAnalog Loop Design with LNP Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 18
E	CLEC-8	2WAnalog Loop Non Design with LNP Dispatch	August	\$6,650	1 / 16
			September	\$8,550	1 / 10
F	CLEC-10	EELs Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 14
G	CLEC-13	EELs Dispatch	August	\$6,650	1 / 52
H	CLEC-1	EELs Dispatch	September	\$6,650	1 / 49

Again, these excessive SEEM payments are not warranted when compared to the level of service provided and to the monthly rate the CLEC pays for these products.

(vii) PERCENT MISSED REPAIR APPOINTMENTS (PMRA)

PMRA measures BellSouth's ability to resolve a trouble report by the committed date and time. BellSouth paid over \$479,000 in PMRA Tier-1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for both UNE and Resale products. Of the \$479,000, BellSouth paid over \$436,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments while missing 6% of the repair commitments to the CLECs. Said another way, even though BellSouth met 94% of all scheduled repair commitments, the SEEM plan required payments of \$436,000. The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments for just one missed repair appointment:



	1	2	3	4	5
A	CLEC	Product/dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	Missed Appt. / Total Appts.
B	CLEC-14	UNE Combo Other Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 6
C				\$4,750	1 / 15
D	CLEC-1	Digital Loop $\geq$ DS1 Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 11
E	CLEC-10	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 6
F	CLEC-15	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	September	\$4,750	1 / 6
G	CLEC-16	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	October	\$6,650	1 / 8
H	CLEC-10	2W Analog Loop Non-Design Non Dispatch	August	\$4,750	1 / 12
I	CLEC-10	UNE ISDN Loop Non Dispatch	October	\$4,750	1 / 22
J		UNE Loop & Port Combo Non Dispatch	August	\$6,650	1 / 43
			October	\$4,750	1 / 26

These excessive SEEM payments are not warranted when compared to the level of service provided and the charge for the affected service. As with other SEEM measures, Percent Missed Repair Appointment results can penalize BellSouth for providing good service. In this instance, the more reliable a network, the fewer trouble reports and repair appointments. And, as a result, there is a greater potential for SEEM payments from just one missed appointment. As noted above, a miss of just one appointment, perhaps for only a few hours, resulted in a payment of nearly \$5,000. Once again, a slight miss resulted in providing the CLEC the equivalent of years of free service.

(viii) MAINTENANCE AVERAGE DURATION (MAD)

This measure indicates the amount of time from receipt of a trouble report until it is cleared. It is disaggregated by product and by dispatch type. BellSouth paid over \$578,000 in Tier-1 payments during the period from August through October 2003 for UNE and Resale SEEM measures for MAD. Of the \$578,000 total, BellSouth paid over \$502,000 in UNE Tier-1 SEEM payments even though 85% of the MAD measurements indicate that BellSouth cleared the CLECs' troubles more quickly than the comparable retail service. The following are some examples where CLECs received SEEM payments even though their average durations were less (better) than the retail comparison:

	1	2	3		5
	CLEC	Product / dispatch	Month '03	SEEM \$	CLEC duration / Retail dur. (hours)
A					
B	CLEC-14	Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	October	\$6,650	4.25 / 5.01
C	CLEC-8	Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	August	\$4,750	4.72 / 5.51
D	CLEC-18	Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	October	\$4,750	4.57 / 5.01
E	CLEC-19	Digital Loop ≥ DS1 Dispatch	September	\$4,750	6.96 / 7.94
F	CLEC-18	UNE ISDN Loop Dispatch	September	\$4,750	5.46 / 6.21
G	CLEC-20	UNE ISDN Loop Dispatch	August	\$4,750	5.90 / 8.12
H	CLEC-18	UNE Line Sharing Dispatch	September	\$4,750	23.86 / 28.20
I	CLEC-21	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	October	\$4,750	20.90 / 23.71
J	CLEC-3	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	August	\$4,750	20.10 / 27.26
K	CLEC-10	UNE Loop & Port Combo Dispatch	August	\$4,750	25.41 / 27.26