

Robert Culpepper General Attorney Legal

AT&T Florida 150 South Monroe Street Room 400 Tallahassee, Florida 32301 T: 404-335-0841 F: 404-927-3618 rc1191@att.com www.att.com

February 10, 2009

Ms. Ann Cole Commission Clerk Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

Re:

Docket No. 000121A-TP

In Re: Investigation into the establishment of operations support systems permanent incumbent local exchange Telecommunications companies

Dear Ms. Cole:

Enclosed is BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. d/b/a AT&T Florida's ("AT&T Florida") Motion to Strike, which we ask that you file in the referenced docket.

A copy of the same is being provided to all parties as reflected in the attached certificate of service.

Sincerely

Robert A. Culpepper

Enclosures

cc: All parties of record

Jerry D. Hendrix

694934

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

| In re: Investigation into the Establishment |) | Docket No.: 000121A-TP |
|---|---|--------------------------|
| Of Operations Support Systems Permanent |) | |
| Performance Measures for Incumbent |) | |
| Local Exchange Telecommunications. |) | Filed: February 10, 2009 |
| Companies (BellSouth Track). |) | • |

MOTION TO STRIKE

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. d/b/a AT&T Florida ("AT&T Florida" or "AT&T") hereby moves for a Commission Order striking the "Response in Opposition to AT&T's Request to Dismiss CLECs' Objection to AT&T Florida's Request for Confidential Classification" ("Response") filed by Cbeyond Communications, LLC, Deltacom, Inc., and NuVox Communications, Inc. (collectively, the "CLECs"). As explained below, the so-called "Response" is an inappropriate reply brief that should not be considered by the Commission because the CLECs failed to obtain permission to file a reply brief.

- 1. In December 2008, the Commission's Staff issued a report entitled "A Review AT&T's OSS April 208 Release Analysis and Resolutions" ("Audit Report"). Because the Audit Report contains proprietary confidential business information, AT&T Florida filed a Request for Confidential Classification ("RCC") on January 9, 2009. The CLECs' filed their objection to the RCC on January 22, 2009 ("Objection"). In their Objection, the CLECs specifically requested for the Commission to deny AT&T Florida's RCC. Objection at page 6 ("AT&T's request for confidential classification must be denied."). Stated another way, CLECs filed a motion requesting for the Commission to deny AT&T Florida's RCC.
- 2. On January 29, 2009, AT&T Florida filed its response to the CLECs' objection to AT&T Florida's RCC ("Response"). In its Response, AT&T Florida explained how its RCC

comports and complies with applicable law and requested a Commission Order declaring "the portions of the Audit Report that AT&T Florida has identified as proprietary confidential business information to be considered and treated as such pursuant to Section 364.183, Florida Statutes and other applicable law." AT&T Florida Response, at page 3. In short, AT&T Florida filed a response to the CLECs' request for the Commission to deny AT&T Florida's RCC.

- 3. On February 3, 2009, without obtaining Commission leave or permission to do so, the CLECs responded to AT&T Florida's Response. Although the CLECs labeled their reply a "Response", there is no question that the pleading is a reply brief as it specifically addresses arguments set forth in AT&T's Response.
- 4. It is well settled that replies are not recognized by the Commission rules or by the Administrative Procedure Act, and therefore cannot be considered by the Commission. As stated by the Commission in an arbitration proceeding involving AT&T and BellSouth:

Further, we find that AT&T's Response to BellSouth's Response is an inappropriate pleading. As noted by BellSouth, in previous cases were a party has filed a pleading not contemplated by our rules or the uniform rules, we have not considered the pleading. Specifically, in the <u>Supra</u> case, we found that "...neither the Uniform Rules nor our rules contemplate a reply to a response to a Motion." We find that AT&T's response is such a pleading. Thus, we shall not consider the arguments raised in AT&T's Response to BellSouth's Response.

Docket No. 020919-TP, Order No. PSC-03-0525-FOF-TP, issued April 21, 2003, at page 9 (footnote omitted).

5. For the reasons set forth herein, AT&T Florida's respectfully requests an Order striking the CLECs' Response to AT&T's Response as an inappropriate pleading.

Respectfully submitted this 10th day of February 2009.

E. EARL EDENFIELD TRACY W. HATCH MANUAL L. GURDIAN 150 So. Monroe Street, Suite 400 Tallahassee, FL 32301 (850) 577-5508

ROBERT A. CULPEPPER

AT&T Midtown Center

Suite 4300

675 W. Peachtree St., NE

Atlanta, GA 30375

(404) 335-0841

Attorneys for AT&T Florida

728735

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE Docket No. 000121A-TP

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served via

Electronic Mail and U.S. Mail the 10th day of February, 2009 to the following:

Adam Teitzman
Staff Counsel
Lisa Harvey
Florida Public Service
Commission
Division of Legal Services
2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850
Tel. No. (850) 413-6175
Fax. No. (850) 413-6250
ateitzma@psc.state.fl.us
Isharvey@psc.state.fl.us

Howard E. (Gene) Adams
Pennington, Moore, Wilkinson,
Bell & Dunbar, P.A.
Post Office Box 10095 (32302)
215 South Monroe Street, 2nd Floor
Tallahassee, FL 32301
Tel. No. (850) 222-3533
Fax. No. (850) 222-2126
gene@penningtonlawfirm.com
Represents Time Warner

David Konuch
Senior Counsel
Regulatory Law & Technology
Florida Cable Telecomm. Assoc.
246 East 6th Avenue
Tallahassee, FL 32303
Tel. No. (850) 681-1990
Fax. No. (850) 681-9676
dkonuch@fcta.com

Douglas C. Nelson Sprint Nextel 233 Peachtree Street, NE Suite 2200 Atlanta, GA 30303 Tel. No. 404 649-0003 Fax No. 404 649-0009 douglas.c.nelson@sprint.com

Vicki Gordon Kaufman
Keefe Anchors Gordon & Moyle P.A.
The Perkins House
118 N. Gadsden St.
Tallahassee, FL 32301
Tel. No. (850) 681-3828
Fax. No. (850) 681-8788
vkaufman@kagmlaw.com
Represents Cebyond
Represents Deltacom

Dulaney O'Roark III (+)
Vice Pres. & Gen. Counsel – SE Region
Verizon
5055 N Point Parkway
Alpharetta, GA 30022
Tel. No. (678) 259-1449
Fax No. (678) 259-1589
De.ORoark@verizon.com

D. Anthony Mastando
DeltaCom
VP-Regulatory Affairs
Senior Regulatory Counsel
Ste 400
7037 Old Madison Pike
Huntsville, AL 35806
Tel. No. (256) 382-3856
Fax No. (256) 382-3936
tony.mastando@deltacom.com

Beth Keating
Akerman Law Firm
106 East College Avenue
Suite 1200
Tallahassee, FL 32301
beth.keating@akerman.com

Ms. Katherine K. Mudge Covad Communications Company 7000 N. MoPac Expressway, Floor 2 Austin, TX 78731 Tel. No. (512) 514-6380 Fax No. (512) 514-6520 kmudge@covad.com

Cbeyond Communications, LLC Charles E. (Gene) Watkins 320 Interstate North Parkway Suite 30 Atlanta, GA 30339 Tel. No. (678) 370- 2174 Fax No. (978) 424-2500 gene.watkins@cbeyond.net

Time Warner
Carolyn Ridley
555 Church Street, Ste. 2300
Nashville, TN 37219
Tel. No. (615) 376-6404
Fax. No. (615) 376-6405
carolyn.ridley@twtelecom.com

Susan J Berlin NuVox 2 N Main St Greenville, Sc 29601 Tel No (864) 331 7323 sberlin@nuvox.com

Robert A. Culpepper

(+) Signed Protective Agreement